

Committees:	Dates:	
West Ham Park Committee Projects Sub	04 February 2019 20 February 2019	
Subject: West Ham Park Playground refurbishment	Gateway 3/4 Options Appraisal (Regular)	Public
Report of: Director of Open Spaces Report Author: Lucy Murphy, West Ham Park Manager		For Decision

Summary

The Playground at West Ham Park needs to be refurbished to ensure its equipment and ancillary buildings are fit for purpose and meet current safety and safeguarding standards.

Much of the equipment is over 15 years old and pieces are regularly closed due to defects. Two pieces have been removed due to safety concerns. An aged children's lido is also present but does not represent a good use of space and is costly to maintain and operate.

Overview of options: Three options for the playground and a further two options for the water play facility have been developed (see Appendix 2 for detailed information). In summary these are:

1. Repair and replace damaged play equipment and surfacing and re-tile the existing children's lido

Alternatively, the playground and water play facility can be redesigned and renewed (each of the water play options are interchangeable with the playground options)

2. Redesign playground within existing footprint
 3. Playground redesigned, footprint extended, Playground office converted to café concession, toilets reconfigured and refurbished.
- A. New waterplay facility with water fountains (operated by hand)
- B. New splash pad style water play facility with automatic jets

Recommendations

Members are asked to

1. Agree that Play Option 3 (Enlarging the footprint of the playground) with Water Play Option A (installing a new water play facility with hand operated water fountains) is progressed at a total estimated cost of £1,184,775 (noting risk against the project).
2. Note that progression of this scheme is subject to the identification of external funding of up to £350,000 and a request to the Resource Allocation Sub and Policy and Resources Committees for an allocation of funding to meet the remaining shortfall estimated at £723,200 from the 2018/19 City's Cash provision for new schemes.

3. Approve a budget of £50,500 for fees and staff costs to reach the next gateway, funded via a further allocation of £10,775 from local risk, along with the reallocation of unspent funds of £39,725 from Gateway 2 to enable the project to reach the next gateway.
4. Note the new project budget of £65,775.

Progress to date: The public were consulted between 23 June and 21 July 2018; over 400 people were engaged with face-to-face and 189 completed an on-line survey (see Appendix 3). Option 3 received the most support, and detailed feedback showed a preference to combine this with water fountains (water play option A). This water play option has lower installation and ongoing maintenance costs than Option B (splashpad), **therefore this combination (option 3A) is the recommended option.**

Whilst conversion of the playground office to an ice cream and café concession may potentially produce a modest increase in income (approximately £5 to £10k over the next 5 years), more importantly it provides a much more comprehensive offer to the public. Refurbishment of the toilet block to allow a baby changing unit to be situated within a toilet cubical in both the boys' and girls' toilet area will avoid potential safeguarding issues (currently only one exists in the girls' toilet handwash area).

The London Borough of Newham is diverse with over a quarter of its population aged under 16, a mix of different ethnicities and over one hundred languages spoken. The proposal to refurbish and extend the playground will have a positive impact on protected characteristics of age, race and disability groups. It is also one of the key Charitable Objects of the Park to provide a playground for youth and meets a number of objectives of the City's Corporate Plan. Extending the footprint of the playground includes additional planting and trees increasing the biodiversity of the area and helping to deliver our Responsible Business Strategy.

Project Status	Amber
Timeline	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • May 2019: Apply to LB Newham for planning approval for playground and concession. Apply for external funding • June 2019: Commence procurement for main works contractor, purchase of play equipment and the detailed design and build of the water play element of the playground. • September 2019: Gateway 5 • October 2019: Commence works on site • Spring 2020: Open playground
Estimated works and equipment cost	£1,119,000
Total estimated project budget cost	£1,184,775

Expenditure to date	£15,275
Budget approved at G2	£55,000
Budget required to G5	<p>Additional funding of £10,775 (from local risk), along with the reallocation of £39,725 from Gateway 2</p> <p>Totalling: £50,500: £6,000 Planning consultant, application and fees £10,000 Water play specialist advice (design fees) £6,500 Quantity surveyor – detailed specification for procurement purposes £15,000 Staff costs/time (1 day per week x 2 quarters) £13,000 specialist surveying work (asbestos; building control; structural engineer)</p>

Procurement Approach:

Advertise requirement for specialist consultancies on the City of London's E-sourcing portal with suppliers invited to express an interest in the work by submitting completed tender applications. Process to be managed in consultation with the City Procurement team (See Appendix 4 and PT4 form).

Existing Funding for scheme implementation:

- £96,300 is available through the City Surveyor for cyclical works associated with existing playground assets, such as railings, toilets and playground office. For the option 1, this money would continue to be needed for basic maintenance of the assets. With options 2 and 3, subject to approvals, these funds could be used to complement additional funding for those same assets, but to create a much-improved offer. The budget to reach Gateway 5 of £65,775 has been funded from local risk resources.

Potential external funding sources: Recommended option 3A has the potential to attract up to approximately £350k from external funding sources such as the London Marathon Charitable Trust and others. The remainder of the funding (£723,200) for the refurbishment would need to be raised internally via a bid for an allocation from the City's Cash 2018/19 provision for new schemes which will be subject to prioritisation against other competing bids for resources.

Risk: Safety is an increasing concern as the likelihood of equipment failure due to its age. Funding and the timing of it is also key. Some current and potential external sources have deadlines after which time they expire. Without any City funding the project would not be able to go ahead and risks mitigated (see Box 4 and separate Risk Register in Appendix 6).

Options Appraisal Matrix

See attached.

Appendices

Appendix 1	Coversheet
Appendix 2	Playground and waterplay options
Appendix 3	Playground consultation key findings
Appendix 4	PT 4 Procurement form
Appendix 5	Proposed layout for toilet block and concession
Appendix 6	Risk Register
Appendix 7	Detailed costing breakdown for each option

Background Information – available on request

Market research report – café concession
Equality Impact Assessment

Contact

Report Author	Lucy Murphy, West Ham Park Manager
Email Address	Lucy.murphy@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	020 8472 3584

Options Appraisal Matrix

	<i>Play Option 1</i>	<i>Play Option 2</i>	<i>Play Option 3</i>	<i>Water Play Option A</i>	<i>Water Play Option B</i>
1. Brief description	Repair and replace damaged play equipment only, and surfacing and retile the existing children's lido	Redesign playground within existing footprint	Playground redesigned, footprint extended. Playground office converted to a café concession, toilets reconfigured and refurbished.	New waterplay facility with water fountains (operated by hand)	New splash pad style water play facility with automatic jets
2. Scope and exclusions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace damaged play equipment • Add new safety surfacing where new play equipment is added • Carry out required works to existing entrance to meet safety standards • Minor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New redesigned integrated play facility for all age groups • Imaginative play integrated within play area design • Trees and additional planting along boundary and within playground in raised planters • Retain newer 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extended, larger playground with new grassed area, • Imaginative play integrated within play area design with integrated play for all age groups • Trees and additional planting along boundary and within playground in raised planters 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New water play area with water pumps and tables for interactive play, in place of existing children's lido 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New water play area consisting of a splash pad facility with water jets, in place of existing children's lido

	<p>improvements carried out to toilet within available budget</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Playground office refurbishment not included 	<p>equipment</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New entrances for ease of access and areas to store buggies and scooters created • Minor improvements carried out to the toilet block within available budgets • Playground office refurbishment not included 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Retain newer equipment • New entrances for ease of access and create areas to store buggies and scooters • Refurbishment of all toilets (including disabled) within block to include two No. larger cubicles with baby changing facilities • Repurpose playground office to small concession/outlet • Children's toilets layout changed to accommodate baby changing unit within a toilet cubical in girls' and boys' sections. 		
--	--	--	---	--	--

<i>Project Planning</i>	1. Repair and replace damaged play equipment and surfacing. Re-tile the existing children's lido	2. Redesign playground within existing footprint	3. Playground redesigned, footprint extended Playground office converted to a café concession, toilets reconfigured and refurbished.	A. New waterplay facility with water fountains (operated by hand)	B New splash pad style water play facility with automatic jets
3. Programme and key dates	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • April 2019: Commence contractor, play equipment and water play design and build procurement • August 2019: Gateway 5 • October 2019: Commence works on site during quieter period • Spring 2020: Open playground 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • May 2019: Apply to LB Newham for planning approval for playground and concession. Apply for external funding • June 2019: Commence contractor, play equipment and water play design and build procurement • September 2019: Gateway 5 • October 2019: Commence works on site • Spring 2020: Open playground 			

4. Risk implications	<p>Safety/Health: Aged and old play equipment and lido leading to increased likelihood of equipment failure and closure of parts of the playground/lido.</p> <p>Financial: Inability to raise enough funds resulting in a delay to the completion of the project and/or reduced scope of what can be delivered.</p> <p>Legal/Statutory: Planning approval not granted from London Borough of Newham resulting in delays, increased costs and change to the scope</p>				
5. Benefits (+) and disbenefits (-)	<p>+ Minimal changes resulting in short delivery time and less disturbance to park users</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - high costs of ongoing waterplay supervision due to required staff presence. - Missed opportunity to increase play value - Only necessary works will be completed, ongoing maintenance costs of 	<p>+ Additional entrance providing increased accessibility</p> <p>+ Boundary and tree planting soften edges and provides benefits for biodiversity and children's connection to it</p> <p>+ Playground spaces opened up with existing internal fencing removed to allow for integrated and accessible play for all, highlighted during public consultation as</p>	<p>As in option two but also:</p> <p>+ modest income generation from conversion of park office to coffee/ice-cream concession.</p> <p>+ greatly improved visitor offer</p> <p>+ Extended play area size increasing play value, connection to nature through increased planting and maximum capacity for use.</p> <p>+ Received highest number of votes in public consultation</p>	<p>+ Water play area would be usable during winter months when water is switched off</p> <p>+ Simple hand pump mechanisms easy to maintain and repair with low on-going costs.</p> <p>+ No staff presence required.</p> <p>+ Most favourable water play option in public consultation.</p>	<p>+ Water play area would still be usable during winter months when water is switched off</p> <p>+ No staff presence required.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Higher ongoing maintenance costs expected from splash pad facility (second favourable water play option)

	<p>equipment will be reduced in the short term, but costs associated with other features will remain</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Potential income generation opportunity from reuse of park office not realised. - Lido would remain inaccessible during winter months reducing usable play space. - Toilet provision would remain the same with baby changing facilities not meeting safeguarding best practice 	<p>important factor for less able-bodied children who currently can't access play equipment due to them being situated in elevated platforms filled with play bark.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> + Redesign all of the existing space including surfacing and fencing reducing short term maintenance costs + Boundary and tree planting increasing biodiversity value and interactions. - potential income generation opportunity from reuse of park office not realised. - Toilet provision would remain the same with only baby changing 	<p>+ Toilet refurbishment to include improvements to baby changing areas to better meet safeguarding standards</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - most costly option 		
--	--	---	---	--	--

	<p>recommendations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Least preferred option from Public consultation - No biodiversity enhancements as no new planting added - Inability to access external funding as would be seen as replacement of existing equipment and City's on-going maintenance liability. No improvement to provision or outcomes associated. 	<p>facilities not meeting safeguarding best practice guidelines</p>			
6. Stakeholders and consultees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • City Surveyor's Department • Open Spaces Department Learning Team • London Borough of Newham – planning authority • Friends of West Ham Park, local schools, community groups and other park users consulted during 				

	community consultation.					
Resource Implications						
7. Total Estimated cost *		1. Repair and replace damaged play equipment. Re-tile existing children's lido	2. Redesign playground within existing footprint	3. Playground redesigned with enlarged footprint, covert playground office and improve toilets	Water play A: new water play facility with water fountains	Water Play B: new splash style water facility with automatic jets
	Playground and built asset cost	£ 378,700	£ 689,000	£ 1,009,000		
	Spend to date	£ 15,275	£ 15,275	£ 15,275		
	Funding requested to Gateway 5	£ 50,500	£ 50,500	£ 50,500		
	Sub-total	£ 444,475	£ 754,775	£ 1,074,775		
	Waterplay - cost of new facility				£ 110,000	£ 227,500
	Total project cost - option 1	£ 444,475				
	Total project cost - with waterplay A		£ 864,775	£ 1,184,775		
	Total project cost - with waterplay B		£ 982,275	£ 1,302,275		
	Recommended option – Option 3 with Water Play option A : Total £1,184,775					

- See Appendix 7 for a detailed breakdown of the costs for each option

	1. Repair and replace damaged play equipment and surfacing. Re-tile the existing children's lido	2. Redesign playground within existing footprint	3. Playground redesigned, footprint extended Playground office converted to a café concession, toilets reconfigured and refurbished.	A. New waterplay facility with water fountains (operated by hand)	B New splash pad style water play facility with automatic jets
--	--	--	---	---	--

8. Funding strategy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> £65,775 has been allocated from local risk £85,300 is available from existing CWP funding (City Surveyor) to repair the playground and re-tile the paddling pool and carry out essential works to pump house Remaining £343,900 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> £65,775 has been allocated from local risk £70,800 is available from existing CWP funding (City Surveyor) towards the playground external works costs It is estimated that around £250k could be raised externally from funds such as the London Marathon trust 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> £65,775 has been allocated from local risk £81,800 is available from existing CWP funding (City Surveyor) towards the playground external works costs and toilet refurbishment. It is estimated that around £350k could be raised externally for this option due to the biodiversity and accessibility 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> £14,500 is available from existing CWP funding (City Surveyor) Remaining £95,500 would need to be met via a bid for additional City's Cash resources from the provision for new schemes. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 14,500 is available from existing CWP funding (City Surveyor) Remaining £213,000 would need to be met via a bid for additional City's Cash resources from the provision for new schemes.
----------------------------	---	---	--	---	---

	would need to be met from a bid for additional City's cash.	due to the enhanced play facilities included in this option <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The remaining £418,700 would need to be met via a bid for additional City's Cash resources from the provision for new schemes.	enhancements that are delivered as part of this project over and above the play improvements as seen in option 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The additional funding of £627,700 would need to be funded via a bid for additional City's Cash resources from the provision for new schemes..		
9. Estimated capital value/return	No return from either option.		Potential modest additional income (£5-10k per annum) from concession, dependent on other potential café concessions on site (i.e. Nursery future use project)	No return from either water play option	
10. Ongoing revenue implications	Design will aim to reduce ongoing maintenance implications of children's lido and be cost neutral or better going forward, with 10-year maintenance-free period (other than cleaning and statutory safety checks) as a minimum requirement				

11. Investment appraisal	not applicable				
12. Affordability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Savings of £8k per year in repair costs to playground • Ongoing 'hidden' labour costs associated with staffing lido would remain • £4k per year in commissioning and chlorine costs would remain. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Savings of £8k per year in repair costs to playground for length of maintenance-free term (+/- 10 years) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Savings of £8k per year in repair costs to playground for length of maintenance-free term (+/- 10 years) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • £2k per year to commission, service and maintain 'hand operated fountain' system 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • £3k per year to commission, service and maintain splash jet system
13. Legal implications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Play equipment and associated surface to adhere to health & safety legislation. • Planning permission is required from the London Borough of Newham. • The objects of the West Ham Park charity are to "...for ever maintain and preserve [the Park] in a proper and ornamental condition as open public grounds and gardens for the resort and recreation of adults and as a playground for children and youth..." • Refreshment facilities are permitted within the Park under the 1874 conveyance and section 76 of the Public Health Acts Amendment Act 1907. 				
14. Corporate	The proposal aligns with the Corporate Property Asset Management Strategy 2017-18:				

property implications	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Operational assets remain in a good, safe and statutory compliant condition.Operational assets are fit for purpose and meet service delivery needs.Opportunities to create additional revenue from the operational property asset base be pursued and promoted where feasible.				
15. Traffic implications	None				
16. Sustainability and energy implications	Use of sustainable materials in construction where possible.			Water play will seek to make efficient use of water and energy resources.	
17. IS implications	Neutral				
18. Equality Impact Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Improved surfacing to allow for better accessibility to 3 pieces of equipment	<ul style="list-style-type: none">More accessible play throughout redesigned play space	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Extended play area providing more quieter areas of play for children with learning issues as well as better accessibility throughout	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Both water play options will provide more accessible play for all abilities than in a traditional lido	
19. Recommendation	Not recommended	Not recommended	Recommended	Recommended	Not Recommended
20. Next Gateway	N/A	N/A	Gateway 4a - Inclusion in Capital		N/A

			Programme	
21. Resource requirements to reach next Gateway	£50,500 Total			
	Item	Reason	Funds/ Source of Funding	Cost (£)
	Planning Consultant and associated fees	To prepare planning application for LB Newham and pay for associated fees	£10,775 from local risk Reallocation of £39,725 remaining from Gateway 2 (also funded from local risk)	£ 6,000
	Water play design fees	Detailed design and specification work for water play feature		£ 10,000
	Quantity surveyor	Detailed specification of scope of works for procurement process		£ 6,500
	Staff costs/time (Open Spaces and City Surveyor)	Managing project and preparing documents for tender process		£ 15,000
	Specialist surveying work	Asbestos refurbishment and demolition survey		£ 2,000
		Structural engineer		£ 7,000
		CAD elevation Plans		£ 2,000
		Building control application & officer visits		£ 2,000
	Total			£ 50,500